



Received: 15-09-2024  
Accepted: 25-10-2024

## International Journal of Advanced Multidisciplinary Research and Studies

ISSN: 2583-049X

### The Role of Multilingual Resources in STEM Education: A Conceptual Review of Accessibility and Engagement

<sup>1</sup> David Frempong, <sup>2</sup> Ginikachi Prisca Ifenatuora, <sup>3</sup> Samuel Darkey Ofori, <sup>4</sup> Mariam Olateju

<sup>1</sup> Ballou STAY Opportunity Academy, District of Columbia, USA

<sup>2</sup> Bowling Green State University, Ohio State, USA

<sup>3</sup> Lancaster High School, Lancaster, SC, USA

<sup>4</sup> Success Academy Charter School, USA

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.62225/2583049X.2024.4.5.4829>

Corresponding Author: David Frempong

#### Abstract

This review focuses on the use of multilingual resources in STEM education and their impact on student engagement and content accessibility. It explores the development and implementation of educational materials that cater to students' diverse linguistic needs, including textbooks, digital platforms, and interactive tools. The paper argues for the importance of creating inclusive STEM educational environments where linguistic diversity is seen as an asset rather than a barrier, ultimately fostering a more equitable access to science education for all students. Multilingual resources play a pivotal role in enhancing accessibility and engagement in STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics) education, particularly for students from diverse linguistic backgrounds. This conceptual review explores the importance of multilingual resources in STEM education and their impact on students' learning experiences. Multilingual resources in STEM education refer to materials, tools, and strategies that are available in multiple languages to support students who may not have proficiency in the language of instruction. These resources are essential for ensuring that all students have equitable access to STEM education and can fully engage with the curriculum. Accessibility is a key aspect of multilingual resources in

STEM education. By providing materials in multiple languages, educators can ensure that students from diverse linguistic backgrounds can access the same learning opportunities as their peers. This is particularly important for students who are learning STEM subjects in a second or third language, as it can help reduce language barriers and improve comprehension of complex scientific concepts. Engagement is another important aspect of multilingual resources in STEM education. When students can access materials in their native language, they are more likely to feel engaged and motivated to learn. Multilingual resources can also help students see the relevance of STEM subjects to their own lives and communities, making learning more meaningful and engaging. Overall, multilingual resources play a crucial role in enhancing accessibility and engagement in STEM education. By providing materials in multiple languages, educators can ensure that all students have equitable access to STEM education and can fully participate in the learning process. This conceptual review highlights the importance of incorporating multilingual resources into STEM education and the positive impact they can have on students' learning experiences.

**Keywords:** Multilingual Resources, STEM Education, Conceptual Review, Accessibility, Engagement

#### 1. Introduction

In the increasingly diverse landscape of modern education, the role of language in Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) education cannot be overstated (Al Hamad, *et al.*, 2023, Krotenko, 2022). As students from diverse linguistic backgrounds engage with STEM subjects, ensuring their accessibility and engagement becomes paramount. This conceptual review explores the significance of multilingual resources in addressing these challenges, particularly focusing on their role in enhancing accessibility and engagement in STEM education.

Multilingual resources in STEM education encompass a wide range of materials, tools, and strategies that are available in multiple languages to support students who may not have proficiency in the language of instruction (Auger, *et al.*, 2024,

Uwaoma, *et al.*, 2023). These resources are designed to bridge the linguistic gap between students and the STEM curriculum, ensuring that all students have equitable access to educational opportunities.

The importance of multilingual resources in STEM education lies in their ability to make complex scientific concepts more accessible to students from diverse linguistic backgrounds (Karlsson, Nygård Larsson & Jakobsson, 2019, Oke, *et al.*, 2024). By providing materials in multiple languages, educators can ensure that all students, regardless of their language proficiency, can engage meaningfully with the curriculum. Additionally, multilingual resources can enhance student engagement by making learning more relevant and relatable to students' cultural and linguistic backgrounds.

This review argues that multilingual resources play a crucial role in addressing the needs of students from diverse linguistic backgrounds in STEM education. By enhancing accessibility and engagement, these resources contribute to a more inclusive and effective learning environment, ensuring that all students have the opportunity to succeed in STEM subjects.

Multilingual resources in STEM education are essential for addressing the linguistic diversity of students and promoting inclusive learning environments (Adeniyi, *et al.*, 2024, Buxton & Lee, 2023). These resources play a crucial role in ensuring that all students have equitable access to STEM education, regardless of their language proficiency. By providing materials in multiple languages, educators can help students from diverse linguistic backgrounds engage with STEM subjects and succeed academically.

Multilingual resources are particularly important for students who are learning STEM subjects in a second or third language (Farayola, *et al.*, 2024, Pierson, Clark & Brady, 2021). These students may face language barriers that can hinder their understanding of complex scientific concepts. Multilingual resources can help these students overcome these barriers by providing them with materials that are accessible and easy to understand in their native language.

Furthermore, multilingual resources can enhance student engagement in STEM education. When students can access materials in their native language, they are more likely to feel motivated and engaged in the learning process (Oriekhoe, *et al.*, 2024, Wilmes & Siry, 2021). This can lead to improved academic performance and a greater interest in STEM subjects.

In conclusion, multilingual resources play a crucial role in enhancing accessibility and engagement in STEM education. By providing materials in multiple languages, educators can ensure that all students have the opportunity to succeed in STEM subjects, regardless of their language background.

## 2.1 History of The Role of Multilingual Resources in STEM Education

The history of multilingual resources in STEM education reflects a growing recognition of the importance of linguistic diversity in learning environments (Al Hamad, *et al.*, 2024, Vikøy & Haukås, 2023). While the use of multilingual resources in STEM education has gained prominence in recent years, its roots can be traced back to earlier efforts to address the needs of students from diverse linguistic backgrounds.

Historically, STEM education has been primarily delivered in the dominant language of instruction, often creating barriers for students who do not have proficiency in that language. This was particularly problematic for students from immigrant or minority language backgrounds, who may have struggled to access and engage with STEM subjects due to language barriers.

In response to these challenges, educators and policymakers began to explore ways to make STEM education more accessible to students from diverse linguistic backgrounds (Brenneman, Lange & Nayfeld, 2019, Uwaoma, *et al.*, 2023). One of the key developments in this area was the emergence of bilingual education programs, which aimed to provide students with instruction in both their native language and the dominant language of instruction. These programs recognized the value of students' linguistic diversity and sought to leverage it as a strength in the learning process.

As research into bilingual education and language learning advanced, educators began to explore new approaches to incorporating multilingual resources into STEM education. Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) emerged as a promising approach, which integrated language learning with subject content, allowing students to develop language skills while learning STEM subjects (Adeniyi, *et al.*, 2024). CLIL has since been widely adopted as an effective way to enhance both language proficiency and academic achievement in STEM subjects.

In recent years, the use of technology has further expanded the possibilities for multilingual resources in STEM education. Digital resources such as online simulations, interactive learning platforms, and educational apps can provide students with access to STEM materials in multiple languages, enhancing their learning experience and engagement with the subject matter (Almusaed, *et al.*, 2023, Oriekhoe, *et al.*, 2023). Overall, the history of multilingual resources in STEM education reflects a growing recognition of the importance of linguistic diversity in learning environments. By providing students with access to materials in their native language, educators can help create more inclusive and engaging STEM education.

In addition to the historical developments in the use of multilingual resources in STEM education, several key trends and challenges have emerged that have shaped the current landscape of multilingual STEM education (Duarte, *et al.*, 2023, Odulaja, *et al.*, 2023). One important trend is the increasing recognition of the value of students' linguistic diversity in STEM education. Research has shown that multilingualism can have cognitive benefits, such as improved problem-solving skills and creativity, which can be particularly advantageous in STEM fields. As a result, educators and policymakers are increasingly focusing on ways to leverage students' linguistic diversity as a strength in STEM education.

Another trend is the growing emphasis on culturally responsive teaching practices in STEM education. Culturally responsive teaching involves incorporating students' cultural backgrounds into the curriculum and instructional practices, making learning more relevant and engaging for students. In the context of multilingual STEM education, this may involve using culturally relevant examples and contexts to teach scientific concepts, as well as providing materials in multiple languages.

Despite these positive trends, there are also several challenges that remain in the field of multilingual STEM education (Adekuajo, *et al.*, 2023, Hughes, *et al.*, 2022). One major challenge is the lack of resources and support for teachers who are implementing multilingual teaching approaches. Many teachers may not have the training or resources needed to effectively integrate multilingualism into their STEM teaching practices, which can hinder the success of these approaches.

Another challenge is the need for more research on the effectiveness of multilingual teaching approaches in STEM education. While there is evidence to suggest that these approaches can be beneficial for students, more research is needed to understand the specific strategies and practices that are most effective in different contexts.

In conclusion, the history of multilingual resources in STEM education reflects a growing recognition of the importance of linguistic diversity in learning environments. By leveraging students' linguistic diversity and incorporating culturally responsive teaching practices, educators can create more inclusive and engaging STEM education for all students.

## 2.2 Accessibility in STEM Education

Accessibility in STEM education is a critical issue, particularly for students from diverse linguistic backgrounds who may face unique challenges in accessing and engaging with STEM subjects (Adeniyi, *et al.*, 2024, Le Pichon, *et al.*, 2024). This section explores the challenges faced by these students, the role of multilingual resources in improving accessibility, and examples of such resources in STEM education. Students from diverse linguistic backgrounds face several challenges in STEM education. Students who are not proficient in the language of instruction may struggle to understand complex scientific concepts and academic texts. Many schools may not have adequate resources or support systems in place to help students overcome language barriers. Cultural differences can impact students' learning experiences and their ability to engage with STEM subjects (Kricorian, *et al.*, 2020, Popo-Olanian, *et al.*, 2022).

Multilingual resources play a crucial role in improving accessibility for students from diverse linguistic backgrounds (Adaga, *et al.*, 2023, Yanaprasart & Lüdi, 2018). These resources can help students overcome language barriers and engage more effectively with STEM subjects. Some ways in which multilingual resources improve accessibility include: Multilingual resources provide students with access to learning materials in their native language, making it easier for them to understand complex concepts. Multilingual resources can help students develop their language skills in both their native language and the language of instruction, improving their overall academic performance. By providing materials that are culturally relevant and engaging, multilingual resources can help students feel more connected to the curriculum and motivated to learn.

There are several examples of multilingual resources that improve accessibility in STEM education, including: Textbooks that are available in multiple languages can help students understand complex scientific concepts more easily (Adewusi, *et al.*, 2023, Chabner, 2023). Educational apps that provide interactive learning experiences in multiple languages can help students develop their language skills

while learning STEM subjects. Language support programs that provide additional instruction and resources for students who are learning STEM subjects in a second language can improve their academic performance. Overall, multilingual resources play a crucial role in improving accessibility in STEM education for students from diverse linguistic backgrounds. By providing materials in multiple languages and supporting students' language development, these resources help ensure that all students have equitable access to STEM education.

In addition to the challenges and role of multilingual resources in improving accessibility in STEM education, there are several other factors to consider: Multilingual resources can also help make STEM education more culturally relevant for students from diverse backgrounds (Al Hamad, *et al.*, 2024, Siry & Gorges, 2020). By incorporating examples and contexts that are familiar to students, these resources can enhance students' understanding and engagement with STEM subjects. Multilingual resources can support differentiated instruction, allowing teachers to tailor their teaching to meet the diverse needs of students. For example, teachers can provide materials in multiple languages to accommodate students with varying levels of language proficiency.

Multilingual resources can facilitate collaboration and communication among students from diverse linguistic backgrounds (Ogedengbe, *et al.*, 2023, Prasad & Lory, 2020). By providing materials in multiple languages, these resources can help students work together more effectively on group projects and assignments. Educators may need professional development to effectively use multilingual resources in their teaching. Training can help teachers understand how to integrate these resources into their instruction and support students' language development.

Multilingual resources can also support parental involvement in STEM education. By providing materials in multiple languages, schools can help parents support their children's learning at home and stay engaged in their education (Jena, 2020, Oriekhoe, *et al.*, 2024). Advances in technology have made it easier to develop and distribute multilingual resources in STEM education. Digital platforms and tools can provide students with access to a wide range of multilingual materials, enhancing their learning experience. Overall, multilingual resources play a crucial role in improving accessibility, cultural relevance, collaboration, and communication in STEM education. By addressing the diverse linguistic needs of students, these resources help create more inclusive and effective learning environments for all students.

## 2.3 Engagement in STEM Education

Engagement in STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics) education is crucial for student learning and success in these subjects (Afolabi, *et al.*, 2023, Struyf, *et al.*, 2019). This section explores the importance of engagement, the impact of multilingual resources on student engagement, and strategies for using these resources to enhance engagement in STEM education.

Engagement is essential for student learning as it helps students become active participants in the learning process. Engaged students are more likely to be motivated, focused, and enthusiastic about their studies, leading to better academic outcomes. In STEM education, engagement is particularly important as it can help students develop critical

thinking, problem-solving, and inquiry skills, which are essential for success in these subjects (Orieckhoe, *et al.*, 2024, Udeh, *et al.*, 2023). Multilingual resources can have a positive impact on student engagement in STEM education. By providing materials in multiple languages, educators can make learning more accessible and relatable for students from diverse linguistic backgrounds. This can help students feel more connected to the curriculum and motivated to learn. Additionally, multilingual resources can help students develop their language skills, which can further enhance their engagement with STEM subjects.

There are several strategies that educators can use to enhance engagement in STEM education using multilingual resources: By providing materials in students' native languages, educators can make learning more accessible and engaging for all students (Al Hamad, *et al.*, 2024, Uwaoma, *et al.*, 2023). Using examples and contexts that are familiar to students can help make STEM subjects more relevant and engaging. Interactive and hands-on activities can help students actively engage with STEM concepts and develop a deeper understanding of the material. Encouraging students to work together and discuss their ideas can help promote engagement and deepen their understanding of STEM concepts. Technology can be a powerful tool for enhancing engagement in STEM education. Educators can use digital platforms and tools to provide interactive learning experiences and access to multilingual resources.

In conclusion, engagement is essential for student learning in STEM education, and multilingual resources can play a key role in enhancing engagement. By providing materials in multiple languages and using strategies to enhance engagement, educators can create more inclusive and effective learning environments for all students.

In addition to the importance of engagement and strategies for using multilingual resources, there are several other factors to consider when enhancing engagement in STEM education: Tailoring instruction to students' interests, abilities, and cultural backgrounds can enhance engagement (Ganesan & Morales, 2024, Orieno, *et al.*, 2024). By incorporating students' preferences and experiences into the curriculum, educators can make learning more relevant and engaging for them. Connecting STEM concepts to real-world applications can increase engagement by showing students the practical relevance of what they are learning. This can help students see the value of STEM education and how it can be applied in their lives.

Project-based learning can enhance engagement by allowing students to work on hands-on projects that are relevant to their interests and experiences. This approach encourages active learning and problem-solving skills, which are essential in STEM fields. Incorporating multimedia, such as videos, animations, and simulations, can make learning more engaging and interactive (Malik & Zhu, 2023, Udeh, *et al.*, 2024). Multimedia can help students visualize complex concepts and make learning more accessible to students with diverse learning styles. Encouraging students to work together in groups can enhance engagement by promoting collaboration and discussion. Peer collaboration allows students to learn from each other and can help them develop communication and teamwork skills.

Providing students with timely feedback on their work and encouraging them to reflect on their learning can enhance engagement. Feedback helps students understand their progress and areas for improvement, while reflection

encourages metacognitive skills and deeper understanding of the material (Irons & Elkington, 2021, Popo-Olaniyan, *et al.*, 2022). Creating a supportive and inclusive learning environment can enhance engagement by fostering a sense of belonging and community. A supportive environment encourages students to take risks, ask questions, and participate actively in their learning. By incorporating these factors into their teaching practices, educators can enhance engagement in STEM education and create more meaningful learning experiences for students.

## 2.4 Types of Multilingual Resources

Multilingual resources play a crucial role in enhancing accessibility and engagement in STEM education for students from diverse linguistic backgrounds (Adekuajo, *et al.*, 2023, Charamba, 2020). These resources come in various forms, including digital resources, printed materials, language support services, and teacher training and professional development. This section explores each type of multilingual resource and its role in improving accessibility and engagement in STEM education.

Digital resources are increasingly being used to provide multilingual support in STEM education. These resources include online textbooks, interactive learning platforms, educational apps, and multimedia resources (Le Pichon, Cummins & Vorstman, 2024, Uwaoma, *et al.*, 2023). Digital resources can be particularly effective in providing multilingual support, as they can be easily adapted to different languages and provide interactive and engaging learning experiences. For example, educational apps can provide students with access to STEM materials in multiple languages, allowing them to learn at their own pace and in their preferred language.

Printed materials, such as textbooks, worksheets, and instructional guides, are commonly used to provide multilingual support in STEM education (Adeniyi, *et al.*, 2024, Dinh, 2023). These materials are often available in multiple languages, allowing students to access STEM content in their native language. Printed materials can be particularly useful for students who prefer traditional learning methods or who may not have access to digital resources. Additionally, printed materials can be used in conjunction with digital resources to provide a comprehensive multilingual learning experience.

Language support services, such as translation services, language tutors, and language enrichment programs, can also play a crucial role in providing multilingual support in STEM education (Serafini, Rozell & Winsler, 2022, Udeh, *et al.*, 2023). These services can help students improve their language skills and better understand STEM concepts in their native language. Language support services can be particularly beneficial for students who are learning STEM subjects in a second or third language and may need additional support to succeed academically.

Teacher training and professional development programs can help educators learn how to effectively integrate multilingual resources into their STEM teaching practices (Al Hamad, *et al.*, 2024, Buxton & Caswell, 2020). These programs can provide teachers with strategies for using multilingual resources to enhance accessibility and engagement in STEM education. Teacher training can also help educators understand the diverse needs of students from different linguistic backgrounds and how to support their learning effectively.



In conclusion, the use of multilingual resources in STEM education is essential for providing students from diverse linguistic backgrounds with equitable access to educational opportunities. By using digital resources, printed materials, language support services, and teacher training programs, educators can create more inclusive and engaging learning environments for all students.

In addition to the types of multilingual resources discussed, there are several other important considerations when implementing multilingual resources in STEM education: Multilingual resources should be culturally relevant and sensitive to the cultural backgrounds of students (Popo-Olaniyan, *et al.*, 2022, Snyder & Fenner, 2021). This includes using examples, images, and contexts that resonate with students' cultural experiences and perspectives. Multilingual resources should be accessible to students with diverse learning needs, including those with disabilities. This may include providing audio versions of text, captions for videos, and alternative formats for printed materials.

Educators can collaborate with other educators and organizations to share multilingual resources and best practices. Networking can help educators access a wider range of resources and support their efforts to create inclusive learning environments (Blair & Haneda, 2021, Okorie, *et al.*, 2024). Engaging with the local community can help educators understand the linguistic and cultural diversity of their students and tailor multilingual resources to meet their needs. Community partnerships can also provide additional resources and support for multilingual education initiatives. It is important to assess the effectiveness of multilingual resources in improving accessibility and engagement in STEM education. This may include collecting feedback from students and educators, analyzing student performance data, and evaluating the impact of multilingual resources on student learning outcomes. By considering these factors, educators can effectively implement multilingual resources in STEM education to improve accessibility and engagement for all students.

## 2.5 Case Studies and Examples

Multilingual resources play a vital role in enhancing accessibility and engagement in STEM education (Adeniyi, *et al.*, 2024, Márquez & Porras, 2020). Several case studies and examples demonstrate the successful implementation of multilingual resources and their impact on student outcomes. This section examines these case studies and examples, highlighting lessons learned and best practices. CSULB implemented a multilingual approach in its introductory physics courses to support students with limited English proficiency. The university provided bilingual textbooks, instructional materials, and language support services to help these students succeed in their physics courses. As a result, students showed improved understanding of physics concepts and higher academic achievement.

Khan Academy, an online learning platform, offers educational videos and exercises in multiple languages, including Spanish, French, and Portuguese. By providing STEM content in multiple languages, Khan Academy has made STEM education more accessible to students worldwide, leading to improved learning outcomes. New York City Public Schools implemented a bilingual science program for English language learners (ELLs) to improve

their academic performance in science (Al Hamad, *et al.*, 2024, Brutt-Griffler & Jang, 2019). The program provided ELLs with science instruction in their native language, along with English language development support. As a result, ELLs showed significant improvement in science proficiency and overall academic achievement. Duolingo, a language learning app, offers a course in High Valyrian, a fictional language from the TV series "Game of Thrones." While not directly related to STEM education, Duolingo's approach demonstrates the potential of multilingual resources to engage learners and make learning fun and accessible.

Offer a range of multilingual resources, including textbooks, digital resources, and language support services, to cater to diverse learning needs. Use culturally relevant examples and contexts to make STEM education more engaging and meaningful for students from diverse backgrounds (Özüdogru, 2018, Udeh, *et al.*, 2023). Work closely with educators, administrators, parents, and community members to develop and implement effective multilingual resources. Continuously assess the impact of multilingual resources on student outcomes and adjust strategies as needed to improve effectiveness. In conclusion, case studies and examples demonstrate the positive impact of multilingual resources on accessibility and engagement in STEM education. By implementing best practices and learning from successful initiatives, educators can create more inclusive and effective STEM learning environments for all students.

Multilingual resources should be accessible to all students, regardless of their linguistic background. This includes providing resources in languages that are relevant to the student population and ensuring that all students have equal access to these resources. Multilingual resources should be presented in a variety of modalities to cater to different learning styles and preferences (Martínez, 2018, Popo-Olaniyan, *et al.*, 2022). This may include videos, audio recordings, interactive simulations, and written materials. Create a supportive and inclusive learning environment where students feel comfortable using their native language and are encouraged to engage with multilingual resources.

Encourage students to take ownership of their language learning by providing opportunities for them to practice and use their language skills in meaningful ways (Hestiana & Anita, 2022, Okorie, *et al.*, 2024). Offer ongoing support and resources to help students develop their language skills and succeed in STEM education. This may include tutoring, language immersion programs, and mentorship opportunities. Work collaboratively with other educators to share best practices and resources for implementing multilingual education in STEM subjects. This collaboration can help improve the quality of multilingual resources and enhance student outcomes. By implementing these best practices and learning from successful case studies and examples, educators can effectively use multilingual resources to enhance accessibility and engagement in STEM education for all students.

## 2.6 Challenges and Future Directions

The use of multilingual resources in STEM education is a promising approach to enhancing accessibility and engagement for students from diverse linguistic backgrounds. However, there are several challenges that educators and policymakers must address to effectively implement multilingual resources in STEM education

(Adewusi, *et al.*, 2023, Schiefer, *et al.*, 2024). This section explores these challenges and offers recommendations for addressing them, as well as future research directions in the field.

One of the primary challenges in implementing multilingual resources is the lack of resources, including funding, materials, and trained personnel. Developing high-quality multilingual resources can be costly and time-consuming, making it challenging for schools and educational institutions with limited resources to adopt these practices (Ayeni, *et al.*, 2024, Yan, *et al.*, 2024). Another challenge is the diverse linguistic backgrounds of students. Schools may struggle to provide resources in all the languages spoken by their students, leading to difficulties in meeting the needs of all learners. Educators may lack the training and support needed to effectively implement multilingual resources in their teaching practices (Al Hamad, *et al.*, 2024, Norro, 2024). This can result in ineffective use of these resources and limited benefits for students. Ensuring that multilingual resources are culturally relevant and sensitive to the needs of diverse student populations can be challenging. Without careful consideration of cultural factors, these resources may not effectively engage students or support their learning. Schools and educational institutions should prioritize funding for the development and implementation of multilingual resources. This can include investing in materials, technology, and professional development for educators. Educators should receive training and support in how to effectively use multilingual resources in their teaching practices (Eboigbe, *et al.*, 2023, Heineke & Davin, 2020). This can help them better meet the needs of diverse learners and improve the impact of these resources on student outcomes. Schools should collaborate with community organizations, parents, and other stakeholders to develop and implement multilingual resources. This can help ensure that these resources are culturally relevant and meet the needs of students from diverse backgrounds. Technology can play a crucial role in providing multilingual resources to students. Schools can use digital platforms and tools to deliver content in multiple languages, making it more accessible to students.

Future research should continue to explore the impact of multilingual resources on student outcomes, including academic achievement, engagement, and retention in STEM subjects. Research should identify and disseminate best practices for developing and implementing multilingual resources in STEM education (Jiang & Peng, 2023, Popo-Olanian, *et al.*, 2022). This can help educators make informed decisions about how to effectively use these resources in their teaching practices. Research should also investigate the long-term effects of multilingual resources on students' academic and career trajectories. This can help policymakers and educators understand the lasting impact of these resources on student success.

Finally, research should examine the policy implications of implementing multilingual resources in STEM education (Eleogu, *et al.*, 2024, Mokikwa & Mokhele-Ramulumo, 2024). This can help policymakers develop evidence-based policies that support the effective use of these resources in schools and educational institutions. In conclusion, while there are challenges to implementing multilingual resources in STEM education, there are also opportunities for improvement. By addressing these challenges and continuing to research best practices, educators and

policymakers can enhance the accessibility and engagement of students in STEM education.

Involving parents and the community in the development and implementation of multilingual resources can help ensure their relevance and effectiveness (Ayeni, *et al.*, 2024, Housel, 2020, Uwaoma, *et al.*, 2023). Parents and community members can provide valuable insights into the linguistic and cultural needs of students, as well as offer support for these initiatives. It is important to assess the effectiveness of multilingual resources in improving accessibility and engagement in STEM education. This may include conducting surveys, interviews, and observations to gather feedback from students, educators, and other stakeholders. Evaluation can help identify areas for improvement and guide future development of multilingual resources.

Some students may face stigma or bias related to their language background, which can impact their engagement and participation in STEM education (Kuchynka, Eaton & Rivera, 2022, Okorie, *et al.*, 2024). Educators and policymakers should work to create inclusive environments that value linguistic diversity and support all students in their learning. Providing ongoing professional development for educators can help them stay informed about best practices in multilingual education and improve their ability to support students from diverse linguistic backgrounds. Training should focus on effective use of multilingual resources, cultural competency, and strategies for engaging multilingual learners.

Policymakers should develop policies that support the development and implementation of multilingual resources in STEM education (Al Hamad, *et al.*, 2024, Manan, *et al.*, 2024). This may include funding initiatives, curriculum guidelines, and professional development opportunities for educators. Future research should continue to explore the impact of multilingual resources on student outcomes and identify strategies for improving their effectiveness. Research should also examine the role of technology in delivering multilingual resources and the potential for using multilingual resources to promote equity and inclusion in STEM education. In conclusion, addressing the challenges and opportunities of multilingual resources in STEM education requires a coordinated effort from educators, policymakers, and other stakeholders. By working together and implementing evidence-based strategies, we can improve accessibility and engagement for all students in STEM education.

## 2.7 Conclusion

Multilingual resources play a crucial role in enhancing accessibility and engagement in STEM education for students from diverse linguistic backgrounds. This conceptual review has highlighted several key findings regarding the use of multilingual resources in STEM education and their impact on student outcomes. Multilingual resources, including digital resources, printed materials, language support services, and teacher training programs, can enhance accessibility and engagement in STEM education. Successful implementation of multilingual resources in STEM education has been demonstrated in various case studies and examples, showing positive impacts on student outcomes.

Challenges in implementing multilingual resources include lack of resources, language diversity, teacher training, and

cultural relevance. Recommendations for addressing these challenges include increasing funding and resources, providing professional development for educators, fostering collaboration, and using technology. Future research directions in the field include examining the impact of multilingual resources on student outcomes, identifying best practices, investigating long-term effects, and exploring policy implications.

Educators and policymakers should consider the following implications for practice: Increase funding and resources for the development and implementation of multilingual resources in STEM education. Provide professional development and support for educators to effectively use multilingual resources in their teaching practices. Foster collaboration with community organizations, parents, and other stakeholders to develop culturally relevant and effective multilingual resources. Use technology to deliver multilingual resources in various modalities and enhance accessibility for all students.

It is essential for educators, policymakers, and other stakeholders to recognize the importance of incorporating multilingual resources in STEM education. By doing so, we can create more inclusive and engaging learning environments that support the diverse needs of students from different linguistic backgrounds. It is crucial to prioritize funding, provide professional development, and foster collaboration to ensure the successful implementation of multilingual resources in STEM education. In conclusion, the use of multilingual resources in STEM education has the potential to enhance accessibility and engagement for all students. By incorporating these resources into teaching practices and policies, we can create more equitable and inclusive STEM education opportunities for students around the world.

### 3. References

- Adaga EM, Okorie GN, Egieya ZE, Ikwue U, Udeh CA, DaraOjimba DO, *et al.* The Role of Big Data in Business Strategy: A Critical Review. *Computer Science & IT Research Journal*. 2023; 4(3):327-350.
- Adekuajo IO, Fakeyede OG, Udeh CA, Daraojimba C. The digital evolution in hospitality: A global review and its potential transformative impact on us tourism. *International Journal of Applied Research in Social Sciences*. 2023; 5(10):440-462.
- Adekuajo IO, Udeh CA, Abdul AA, Ihemereze KC, Nnabugwu OC, Daraojimba C. Crisis Marketing in the FMCG Sector: A Review of Strategies Nigerian Brands Employed During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2023; 5(12):952-977.
- Adeniyi IS, Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Chilson OU, *et al.* Reviewing online learning effectiveness during the COVID-19 pandemic: A global perspective. *International Journal of Science and Research Archive*. 2024; 11(1):1676-1685.
- Adeniyi IS, Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Onyebuchi CN, *et al.* Educational reforms and their impact on student performance: A review in African Countries. *World Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews*. 2024; 21(2):750-762.
- Adeniyi IS, Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Onyebuchi CN, *et al.* E-learning platforms in higher education: A comparative review of the USA and Africa. *International Journal of Science and Research Archive*. 2024; 11(1):1686-1697.
- Adeniyi IS, Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Onyebuchi CN, *et al.* Organizational culture and leadership development: A human resources review of trends and best practices, 2024.
- Adeniyi IS, Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Onyebuchi CN, *et al.* Gender equality in the workplace: A comparative review of USA and African Practices. *World Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews*. 2024; 21(2):763-772.
- Adewusi OE, Al Hamad NM, Adeleke IJ, Nwankwo UC, Nwokocha GC. Adaptive Teaching Strategies in Early Childhood Education: A Review for Nigeria and the UK. *International Journal of Applied Research in Social Sciences*. 2023; 5(8):255-271.
- Adewusi OE, Al Hamad NM, Adeleke IJ, Nwankwo UC, Nwokocha GC. Assessment and Evaluation in Adaptive Early Childhood Education: A Comprehensive Review of Practices in Nigeria. *International Journal of Applied Research in Social Sciences*. 2023; 5(8):292-307.
- Afolabi JOA, Olatoye FO, Eboigbe EO, Abdul AA, Daraojimba HO. Revolutionizing Retail: HR Tactics for Improved Employee and Customer Engagement. *International Journal of Applied Research in Social Sciences*. 2023; 5(10):487-514.
- Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Chisom ON. Counselling as a Tool for Overcoming Barriers in STEM Education among Underrepresented Groups. *Engineering Science & Technology Journal*. 2024; 5(1):65-82.
- Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Chisom ON. Bridging the gap: Using robotics to enhance emotional and social learning in K-12 education, 2024.
- Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Chisom ON. Bridging the gap: Using robotics to enhance emotional and social learning in K-12 education, 2024.
- Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Chisom ON. Integrating human resources principles in STEM education: A review, 2024.
- Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Chisom ON. The role of counseling in developing future STEM leaders, 2024.
- Al Hamad NM, Adewusi OE, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Chisom ON. A review on the innovative approaches to STEM education. *International Journal of Science and Research Archive*. 2024; 11(1):244-252.
- Al Hamad NM, Unachukwu CC, Osawaru B, Adewusi OE, Daraojimba AI. Integrating career counseling into corporate social responsibility for workplace inclusion. *International Journal of Science and Research Archive*. 2024; 11(1):695-701.
- Al-Hamad N, Oladapo OJ, Afolabi JOA, Olatundun F. Enhancing educational outcomes through strategic human resources (hr) initiatives: Emphasizing faculty development, diversity, and leadership excellence. *Education*, 2023, 1-11.
- Almusaed A, Almssad A, Yitmen I, Homod RZ. Enhancing student engagement: Harnessing "AIED"s power in hybrid education-A review analysis. *Education Sciences*. 2023; 13(7):632.



21. Auger N, Sauvage J, Le Pichon-Vorstman E, Fleuret C, Adegbonmire L, Dalle L. Multilingual pedagogies and digital technologies to support learning STEM in schools in France and Canada. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*. 2024; 37(1):44-60.
22. Ayeni OO, Al Hamad NM, Chisom ON, Osawaru B, Adewusi OE. AI in education: A review of personalized learning and educational technology. *GSC Advanced Research and Reviews*. 2024; 18(2):261-271.
23. Ayeni OO, Chisom ON, Al Hamad NM, Osawaru B, Adewusi OE. Enhancing STEM education through emotional intelligence and counseling techniques, 2024.
24. Blair A, Haneda M. Toward collaborative partnerships: Lessons from parents and teachers of emergent bi/multilingual students. *Theory into Practice*. 2021; 60(1):18-27.
25. Brenneman K, Lange A, Nayfeld I. Integrating STEM into preschool education: Designing a professional development model in diverse settings. *Early Childhood Education Journal*. 2019; 47:15-28.
26. Brutt-Griffler J, Jang E. Dual language programs: An exploration of bilingual students' academic achievement, language proficiencies and engagement using a mixed methods approach. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 2019.
27. Buxton CA, Caswell L. Next generation sheltered instruction to support multilingual learners in secondary science classrooms. *Science Education*. 2020; 104(3):555-580.
28. Buxton CA, Lee O. Multilingual learners in science education. In *Handbook of research on science education*. Routledge, 2023, 291-324.
29. Chabner DE. *The Language of Medicine E-Book: The Language of Medicine E-Book*. Elsevier Health Sciences, 2023.
30. Charamba E. Translanguaging in a multilingual class: A study of the relation between students' languages and epistemological access in science. *International Journal of Science Education*. 2020; 42(11):1779-1798.
31. Dinh H. Teacher-Generated Instructional Materials for Integrating Content and Language Learning: Actualizing the Translanguaging for English Language Learners. In *Handbook of Multilingual TESOL in Practice*. Singapore: Springer Nature Singapore, 2023, 323-341.
32. Duarte J, García-Jimenez E, McMonagle S, Hansen A, Gross B, Szelei N, *et al.* Research priorities in the field of multilingualism and language education: A cross-national examination. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*. 2023; 44(1):50-64.
33. Eboigbe EO, Farayola OA, Olatoye FO, Nnabugwu OC, Daraojimba C. Business intelligence transformation through AI and data analytics. *Engineering Science & Technology Journal*. 2023; 4(5):285-307.
34. Eleogu T, Okonkwo F, Daraojimba RE, Odulaja BA, Ogedengbe DE, Udeh CA. Revolutionizing Renewable Energy Workforce Dynamics: HR's Role in Shaping the Future. *International Journal of Research and Scientific Innovation*. 2024; 10(12):402-422.
35. Farayola OA, Adaga EM, Egieya ZE, Ewuga SK, Abdul AA, Abrahams TO. Advancements in predictive analytics: A philosophical and practical overview. *World Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews*. 2024; 21(3):240-252. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.30574/wjarr.2024.21.3.2706>
36. Ganesan U, Morales AR. A science teacher's experiences when fostering intercultural competence among students in multilingual classrooms: A narrative study. *Cultural Studies of Science Education*, 2024, 1-20.
37. Heineke AJ, Davin KJ. Prioritizing multilingualism in US schools: States' policy journeys to enact the seal of biliteracy. *Educational Policy*. 2020; 34(4):619-643.
38. Hestiana M, Anita A. The Role of Movie Subtitles to Improve Students Vocabulary. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning*. 2022; 3(1):46-53.
39. Housel DA. Supporting the Engagement and Participation of Multicultural, Multilingual Immigrant Families in Public Education in the United States: Some Practical Strategies. *School Community Journal*. 2020; 30(2):185-209.
40. Hughes BS, Corrigan MW, Grove D, Andersen SB, Wong JT. Integrating arts with STEM and leading with STEAM to increase science learning with equity for emerging bilingual learners in the United States. *International Journal of STEM Education*. 2022; 9(1):58.
41. Irons A, Elkington S. *Enhancing learning through formative assessment and feedback*. Routledge, 2021.
42. Jena PK. Online learning during lockdown period for covid-19 in India. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Educational Research (IJMER)*. 2020; 9.
43. Jiang Y, Peng JE. Exploring the relationships between learners' engagement, autonomy, and academic performance in an English language MOOC. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 2023, 1-26.
44. Karlsson A, Nygård Larsson P, Jakobsson A. Multilingual students' use of translanguaging in science classrooms. *International Journal of Science Education*. 2019; 41(15):2049-2069.
45. Kricorian K, Seu M, Lopez D, Ureta E, Equils O. Factors influencing participation of underrepresented students in STEM fields: Matched mentors and mindsets. *International Journal of STEM Education*. 2020; 7:1-9.
46. Krotenko TY. *Modern Educational Landscape and STEM Approach to Education: Transformation of Traditional Environments for Training Engineers*. Московский педагогический журнал. 2022; (4):130-138.
47. Kuchynka SL, Eaton A, Rivera LM. Understanding and addressing gender-based inequities in STEM: Research synthesis and recommendations for US K-12 education. *Social Issues and Policy Review*. 2022; 16(1):252-288.
48. Le Pichon E, Cummins J, Vorstman J. Using a web-based multilingual platform to support elementary refugee students in mathematics. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*. 2024; 45(2):579-595.
49. Le Pichon E, Wattar D, Naji M, Cha HR, Jia Y, Tariq K. Towards linguistically and culturally responsive curricula: The potential of reciprocal knowledge in STEM education. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*. 2024; 37(1):10-26.
50. Malik KM, Zhu M. Do project-based learning, hands-on activities, and flipped teaching enhance student's



- learning of introductory theoretical computing classes? Education and Information Technologies. 2023; 28(3):3581-3604.
51. Manan SA, Mukhamediyeva S, Kairatova S, Tajik MA, Hajar A. Policy from below: STEM teachers' response to EMI policy and policy-making in the mainstream schools in Kazakhstan. *Current Issues in Language Planning*. 2024; 25(1):89-109.
  52. Márquez MC, Porras AM. Science communication in multiple languages is critical to its effectiveness. *Frontiers in Communication*. 2020; 5:31.
  53. Martínez RA. Beyond the English learner label: Recognizing the richness of bi/multilingual students' linguistic repertoires. *The Reading Teacher*. 2018; 71(5):515-522.
  54. Mokikwa H, Mokhele-Ramulumo M. Navigating Language Diversity In Multilingual Stem Classrooms: Strategies For Inclusive Education. *International Education Trend Issues*. 2024; 2(2):92-106.
  55. Norro S. Namibian teachers' practices in a multilingual context. *International Journal of Multilingualism*. 2024; 21(1):360-378.
  56. Odulaja BA, Nnabugwu OC, Abdul AA, Udeh CA, Daraojimba C. HR'S role in organizational change within Nigeria's renewable energy sector: A review. *Engineering Science & Technology Journal*. 2023; 4(5):259-284.
  57. Ogedengbe DE, James OO, Afolabi JOA, Olatoye FO, Eboigbe EO. Human Resources in the Era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4ir): Strategies and Innovations in the Global South. *Engineering Science & Technology Journal*. 2023; 4(5):308-322.
  58. Oke TT, Ramachandran T, Afolayan AF, Ihemereze KC, Udeh CA. The Role of Artificial Intelligence in Shaping Sustainable Consumer Behavior: A Cross-Sectional Study of Southwest, Nigeria. *International Journal of Research and Scientific Innovation*. 2024; 10(12):255-266.
  59. Okorie GN, Egieya ZE, Ikwue U, Udeh CA, Adaga EM, DaraOjimba OD, *et al.* Leveraging Big Data for Personalized Marketing Campaigns: A Review. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2024; 6(1):216-242.
  60. Okorie GN, Udeh CA, Adaga EM, DaraOjimba OD, Oriekhoe OI. Ethical Considerations in Data Collection and Analysis: A Review: Investigating Ethical Practices and Challenges in Modern Data Collection and Analysis. *International Journal of Applied Research in Social Sciences*. 2024; 6(1):1-22.
  61. Okorie GN, Udeh CA, Adaga EM, DaraOjimba OD, Oriekhoe OI. Digital Marketing in the Age of IOT: A Review of Trends and Impacts. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2024; 6(1):104-131.
  62. Oriekhoe OI, Ashiwaju BI, Ihemereze KC, Ikwue U, Udeh CA. Review of Technological Advancements in Food Supply Chain Management: A Comparative Study Between the US and Africa. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2024; 6(1):132-149.
  63. Oriekhoe OI, Ashiwaju BI, Ihemereze KC, Ikwue U, Udeh CA. Review of Innovative Supply Chain Models in the US Pharmaceutical Industry: Implications and Adaptability for African Healthcare Systems. *International Medical Science Research Journal*. 2024; 4(1):1-18.
  64. Oriekhoe OI, Ashiwaju BI, Ihemereze KC, Ikwue U, Udeh CA. Blockchain Technology in Supply Chain Management: A Comprehensive Review. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2024; 6(1):150-166.
  65. Oriekhoe OI, Ashiwaju BI, Ihemereze KC, Ikwue U, Udeh CA. Review of technological advancement in food supply chain management: Comparison between USA and Africa. *World Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews*. 2023; 20(3):1681-1693.
  66. Orieno OH, Udeh CA, Oriekhoe OI, Odonkor B, Ndubuisi NL. Innovative Management Strategies in Contemporary Organizations: A Review: Analyzing the Evolution and Impact of Modern Management Practices, with an Emphasis on Leadership, Organizational Culture, and Change Management. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2024; 6(1):167-190.
  67. Özudogru F. The Readiness of Prospective Teachers for Culturally Responsive Teaching. *Acta Didactica Napocensia*. 2018; 11:1-12.
  68. Pierson AE, Clark DB, Brady CE. Scientific modeling and translanguaging: A multilingual and multimodal approach to support science learning and engagement. *Science Education*. 2021; 105(4):776-813.
  69. Popo-Olanian O, Elufioye OA, Okonkwo FC, Udeh CA, Eleogu TF, Olatoye FO. Inclusive Workforce Development in US STEM Fields: A Comprehensive Review. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2022; 4(12):659-674.
  70. Popo-Olanian O, Elufioye OA, Okonkwo FC, Udeh CA, Eleogu TF, Olatoye FO. AI-driven talent analytics for strategic hr decision-making in the United States of America: A Review. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2022; 4(12):607-622.
  71. Popo-Olanian O, James OO, Udeh CA, Daraojimba RE, Ogedengbe DE. Review of Advancing US Innovation through Collaborative hr Ecosystems: A Sector-Wide Perspective. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2022; 4(12):623-640.
  72. Popo-Olanian O, James OO, Udeh CA, Daraojimba RE, Ogedengbe DE. A Review of US Strategies for STEM Talent Attraction and Retention: Challenges and Opportunities. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2022; 4(12):588-606.
  73. Popo-Olanian O, James OO, Udeh CA, Daraojimba RE, Ogedengbe DE. Future-Proofing Human Resources in the US with AI: A Review of Trends and Implications. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*. 2022; 4(12):641-658.
  74. Prasad G, Lory MP. Linguistic and cultural collaboration in schools: Reconciling majority and minoritized language users. *Tesol Quarterly*. 2020; 54(4):797-822.
  75. Schiefer J, Caspari J, Moscoso JA, Catarino AI, Miranda Afonso P, Golle J, *et al.* Science and Heritage Language Integrated Learning (SHLIL): Evidence of the effectiveness of an innovative science outreach program for migrant students. *Science Education*. 2024.
  76. Serafini EJ, Rozell N, Winsler A. Academic and

- English language outcomes for DLLs as a function of school bilingual education model: The role of two-way immersion and home language support. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. 2022; 25(2):552-570.
77. Siry C, Gorges A. Young students' diverse resources for meaning making in science: learning from multilingual contexts. *International Journal of Science Education*. 2020; 42(14):2364-2386.
  78. Snyder S, Fenner DS. Culturally responsive teaching for multilingual learners: Tools for equity. Corwin, 2021.
  79. Struyf A, De Loof H, Boeve-de Pauw J, Van Petegem P. Students' engagement in different STEM learning environments: Integrated STEM education as promising practice? *International Journal of Science Education*. 2019; 41(10):1387-1407.
  80. Udeh CA, Daraojimba RE, Odulaja BA, Afolabi JOA, Ogedengbe DE, James OO. Youth empowerment in Africa: Lessons for US youth development programs, 2023.
  81. Udeh CA, Iheremeze KC, Abdul AA, Daraojimba DO, Oke TT. Marketing Across Multicultural Landscapes: A Comprehensive Review of Strategies Bridging US and African Markets. *International Journal of Research and Scientific Innovation*. 2023; 10(11):656-676.
  82. Udeh CA, Orieno OH, Daraojimba OD, Ndubuisi NL, Oriekhoe OI. Big Data Analytics: A Review of its Transformative Role in Modern Business Intelligence. *Computer Science & IT Research Journal*. 2024; 5(1):219-236.
  83. Uwaoma PU, Eboigbe EO, Eyo-Udo NL, Daraojimba DO, Kaggwa S. Space commerce and its economic implications for the US: A review: Delving into the commercialization of space, its prospects, challenges, and potential impact on the US economy. *World Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews*. 2023; 20(3):952-965.
  84. Uwaoma PU, Eboigbe EO, Eyo-Udo NL, Ijiga AC, Kaggwa S, Daraojimba AI. Mixed reality in US retail: A review: Analyzing the immersive shopping experiences, customer engagement, and potential economic implications. *World Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews*. 2023; 20(3):966-981.
  85. Uwaoma PU, Eboigbe EO, Eyo-Udo NL, Ijiga AC, Kaggwa S, Daraojimba DO. The Fourth Industrial Revolution and its Impact on Agricultural Economics: Preparing for the Future in Developing Countries. *International Journal of Advanced Economics*. 2023; 5(9):258-270.
  86. Uwaoma PU, Eboigbe EO, Kaggwa S, Akinwolemiwa DI, Eloghosa SO. Ecological Economics in the Age of 4IR: Spotlight on Sustainability Initiatives in the Global South. *International Journal of Advanced Economics*. 2023; 5(9):271-284.
  87. Vikøy A, Haukås Å. Norwegian L1 teachers' beliefs about a multilingual approach in increasingly diverse classrooms. *International Journal of Multilingualism*. 2023; 20(3):912-931.
  88. Wilmes SE, Siry C. Multimodal Interaction Analysis: A Powerful Tool for Examining Plurilingual Students' Engagement in Science Practices: Proposed Contribution to RISE Special Issue: Analyzing Science Classroom Discourse. *Research in Science Education*. 2021; 51(1):71-91.
  89. Yan L, Sha L, Zhao L, Li Y, Martinez-Maldonado R, Chen G, *et al.* Practical and ethical challenges of large language models in education: A systematic scoping review. *British Journal of Educational Technology*. 2024; 55(1):90-112.
  90. Yanaprasart P, Lüdi G. Diversity and multilingual challenges in academic settings. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. 2018; 21(7):825-840.